



Child labour in Vietnam

An annotated bibliography

May 2022

Colophon

Child labour in Vietnam

An annotated bibliography

Authors Oscar Andrés alva Arias and Nguyen Thi Thu Hien

Edited by Lidewij Rouhof

Date May 2022

Published by

Work No Child's Business (WNCB).

The WNCB alliance consists of **Save the children the Netherlands; UNICEF the Netherlands and the Stop Child Labour Coalition.**

The alliance aims to achieve that children and youth are free from child labour and enjoy their rights to quality education and (future) decent work. We work in six countries: Cote d'Ivoire, India, Jordan, Mali, Uganda and Vietnam.

In Vietnam, WNCB programme works with UNICEF, Save the Children and The Centre for Child Rights and Business.

Table of contents

Introduction	4
Summary	5
WNCB focus themes	6
Education and child labour	6
Child protection and child labour	6
Responsible business and child labour	7
Gender and child labour	7
WNCB focus sector	8
Garment, textile and footwear	8
Domestic work	9
Small enterprises	9
Recommendation for follow-up research	10
WNCB focus themes	11
WNCB focus sectors	11
Annotated bibliography	12
Introduction	12
Prevalence	12
Social and cultural causes of child labour	14
WNCB focus themes	18
Education and child labour	18
Child protection and child labour	22
Responsible business and child labour	26
Gender and child labour	29
WNCB focus sectors	32
Garment, textile and footwear	32
Domestic work and small enterprises	37

Introduction

The purpose of this document is to provide an overview of the child labour situation in Vietnam. It does so through an annotated bibliography, consisting of academic articles, studies and reports that are collected through desk research by students of Leiden University in the Netherlands in 2020. In 2021, the bibliographies were updated and re-organised, using both online search tools and the Vietnam National University library in Hanoi, Vietnam, by students Nguyen Thi Thu Hien and Oscar Andrés alva Arias, under the technical assistance of the research working group within the “Work: No Child’s Business” (WNCB) programme. This document contains 71 relevant materials published between 2002 - 2021.

The materials in the annotated bibliography are categorised as follows: (1) introduction to child labour in Vietnam, presenting the prevalence, history and socio-cultural causes; (2) WNCB’s focus themes of child labour which are education, child protection, responsible business and gender; (3) WNCB’s focus sectors of child labour in Vietnam which are, firstly, garment, textile, footwear and, secondly, domestic work and small enterprises.

The following paragraphs present the main findings in a summary and recommendations for further research in order to create an even more holistic understanding of the child labour situation in Vietnam.

Summary

All information presented and discussed in this chapter is taken from the sources as outlined in the annotated bibliography.

Child labour is a tough issue that has existed in Vietnam for at least more than three decades. All of the collected materials point out that the important turning point for the situation of child labour in Vietnam is the Renovation Policy of 1986. Also, the context of global integration has raised Vietnam's legal awareness and has resulted in the country's active measures to fight against child labour.

One of the most robust causes of child labour in Vietnam is economic and social poverty, including factors of low educational levels, job insecurities, overpopulation, migration, lack of earners in household due to family structures, natural disasters and war aftermaths. The living environment also plays a role, for example, children from complicated living areas or from unorganised families have a higher risk in participating in the labour market too early. Then, there are the cultural factors of materialism, limited legal awareness, perception of education and the perception of life quality, gender, ethnic discrimination and views of child labour as a way to grow up and/or as a continuation of ancestor's traditions.

It seems to be the case that child labour exists sporadically in the WNCB's focus sectors and industries of garment, textile and footwear; domestic work and small enterprises. It should be noted, however, as child labour in these sectors tend to appear in hidden form, that it is difficult to obtain adequate information to fully capture the child labour situation in Vietnam. The high informality and culture of secrecy in these sectors should be addressed thoroughly, moving towards an official and comprehensive database of child labour in Vietnam.

The major challenges in the fight against child labour in these sectors are limited awareness, insufficient regulations in the legal system and limited inspection and management regimes. Poverty alleviation is essential for child labour elimination while fueling money only is not enough and is considered as not a sustainable solution. Instead, policies should focus on raising awareness and perception change for both parents and children. The best solutions for the dilemma of subsistence versus the possibility of investing in human capital to break circles of poverty, are stricter and more sufficient regulations, enhanced inspection regime and most importantly, education and training for all. Also, child labour prevention has a close relationship and active interaction, with education, child protection, responsible

business and gender. These approaches need to be taken into account in the search for solutions. This also suggests that child labour prevention is a shared responsibility of whole society and further cooperation between actors is required.

All of the suggestions should be executed with special attention to children in rural and remote areas, those from ethnic minorities and children left behind, as they are the most vulnerable. Those marginalised groups require tailored policies and interventions.

WNCB focus themes

Education and child labour

All the findings point out the close relationship between education and child labour as characterized by their direct reciprocal interaction. Factual evidence indicates, firstly, that one of the main factors leading to child labour incident is parents' limited educational level. Shaping the perception of both parents and children on the importance and necessity of education could affect their choice of sending children to work. Secondly, children's performance at school seems to be both cause and effect in child labour. In particular, children with low records will gradually lose their interests in learning and end up leaving or dropping out of school to join the labour market and vice versa. Spending too much time on work will affect children's school attendance and performance.

The lack of proper education results in low quality labour force and, therefore, affects future job opportunities and job security of children, contributing to the robust determinant of child labour as is poverty. This will create an intergenerational and vicious circle in which children could repeat their parent's choices in the future. Children in rural or remote areas and children from ethnic minorities face even more barriers in their right to education.

Child protection and child labour

All of the findings point out a high intertwinement between child protection and child labour. Child protection is to protect children from premature work in order to ensure a safe, healthy and happy childhood, their physical and mental development as well as an enjoyment of fundamental rights. This requires preventive measures like transparent birth registration, adequate social welfare for children and parents, and job security for parents to mitigate the risks of sending children to work. These measures should be carried out with flexibility because some types of work are helpful for children, so long as they are suitable to children's age and do not affect children's development and enjoyment of legitimate rights.

Child protection also means protecting in-work children from long working hours, heavy, hazardous and dangerous work and from exploitation, abuse or trafficking. Measures include enhancing inspection, management and punishment; revising and improving legal framework on child protection and raising legal knowledge and awareness of parents and children about their rights, so that children can protect themselves. These children must also be offered recovery and reintegration plans after work. Special attention is required in certain hidden forms of child labour and in marginalized vulnerable groups of children.

Responsible business and child labour

The materials on the WNCB focus theme “responsible business and child labour” attempts to analyze the implementation of business responsibilities towards children. Responsible business means no toleration of child labour in the whole supply chain, including with subcontractors and through intermediaries. However, this should be conducted with flexibility and should not be interpreted as depriving job opportunities of children who have reached the legal working age, provided that the working conditions and environment are suitable and not causing any harmful effects to them. The responsibilities also extend to a larger scale, in which business shall take actions to provide social welfare of both parents and children, especially to create job security for parents (fair wage, safe and healthy working environment, etc.).

Companies, enterprises and business alike, must understand that conducting social responsibilities towards children will give them a wide range of benefits, especially in the context of global integration and trade liberalisation where foreign partners and investors are serious about labour standards. Moreover, child labour leads to higher numbers of school drop outs and affects the quality of labour force and consequently impede business’s productivity. Joining hands in preventing child labour will contribute to ethical and sustainable development of businesses.

However, there are challenges encountered, mainly from the lack of age verification systems as well as inspection, traceability and connection in the supply chain; ignorance or limited legal awareness from enterprises, especially in small and private establishments. A thing to note is that business responsibilities shall not undervalue, but shall take into consideration the consumers’ role, as their attitude can have a great impacts on enterprises’ choice of using child labour.

Gender and child labour

The materials presented indicate that a gender approach is very important when tackling

the issue of child labour in Vietnam. The 2nd National Survey on Child labour points out that the majority of children participating in economic activities, mostly boys perform heavy and dangerous work in hazardous environments. The findings from other sources seem to contradict with the Survey when suggesting that girls are the most vulnerable to child labour risks. In fact, it is not a contradiction because the decision to send girls or boys to work will depend mainly on the families' background and the type of work to be engaged by those children and there is a difference in which sector girls and boys will work. For example, there are cases where boys are sent to work instead of girls as their physical strength makes them useful and suitable for certain types of work. Moreover, if poor performance at school is the driving force for children's decision to work, then girls will likely stay at school for a longer time than boys and therefore, have a lower incidence of premature work than boys. Furthermore, girls tend to work in hidden forms of child labour (e.g. domestic workers), making it difficult to be detected. Regarding discrimination due to gender biases at work, it may appear in the forms of payment gap, discouraging words and actions towards female workers. Some of the studies suggest to enhance the role of women in the fight against child labour in Vietnam.

WNCB focus sector

Garment, textile and footwear

The industries of garment, textile and footwear are among the biggest employers of child labour in Vietnam. Child labour tend to appear in medium size or low tier factories, small production units at early stages of production. There are several factors leading to this situation. Beside poverty and limited awareness and legal knowledge of both children and employers, the main reason is increasing demands for products. As a result, employers tend to seek for a cost-effective solution as child labour - a labour source that is cheap and especially obedient. Moreover, there is the belief that there are certain tasks that children can do better than adults, especially those requiring meticulousness and ingenuity.

Working in the garment, textile and footwear industries is found to be harmful for children due to long working hours, inflexible positions, sometimes polluted atmosphere, etc. Multiple studies also indicate certain challenges in the inspection and control of child labour in these sectors, including the lack of age verification system, child labourers being undocumented, the culture of secrecy, etc. These problems have also created obstacles to fully picturize the situation, which is a significant weakness of the available studies on child labour in these sectors.

Domestic work

Child domestic work is a hot issue that requires special attention when tackling child labour in Vietnam. Child domestic work is mostly prevalent for girls and in rural areas. The major causes of child domestic workers are poverty; the commonality of children helping their parents with the housework and the fine line between these activities and domestic work; the lack of education, leading to limited choices of work; rapid urbanisation and households' economic development.

The COVID-19 pandemic could have exacerbated the situation, when in many families, parents have become more reliant on their children in housework. Domestic workers in general and child domestic workers in particular have to experience many in-work risks, therefore, in some cases domestic work is considered as one of the worst forms of child labour. Due to the isolated and invisible nature of domestic work, child labourers in this field become even more vulnerable. This is also a huge challenge in detecting child domestic workers, as it is a hidden form of labour, where working children are not documented. Other challenges stem from the lack of databases and insufficient regulations on this type of labour in both national and international labour law. In particular, until now, there has not been any universal definition of domestic work as well as a globally agreed list of activities constituting domestic work. Furthermore, the term “domestic helpers” also causes ambiguity in defining this type of work.

Small enterprises

In the last WNCB focus sector of small enterprises, the materials present that while child labour may not exist in big enterprises, it is very common in small enterprises as in the food, restaurant, wood processing, seafood and brick manufacturing industries. The demand for low production cost has driven many small enterprises to hide premature workers. Another problem is that when a country relies too much on the informal sectors, child labour rates will increase together with the country's economic development. This, similar to domestic work, is a hidden form of child labour where workers are more vulnerable to risks of abuse or exploitation than in big companies or formal sectors. Tackling this issue remains challenging due to an insufficient inspection regime and regulations on the informal sectors. It is suggested that the government should address the high informality of small enterprises in the country.

Other challenges come from limited awareness, ignorance or avoidance of enterprises or children themselves when being approached by local authorities. This also explains why there are limited studies that can fully capture the violations of child labour in small enterprises.

Recommendation for follow-up research

To create an even more holistic understanding of child labour in Vietnam, there are various recommendations for follow-up research outlined below. These recommendations are derived from the sources gathered in the annotated bibliography.

Various economic and social development in Vietnam has had an effect on child labour occurrence and on the interventions that have been implemented. It is for the acknowledgment that child labour does not occur in isolation, but rather in reaction to or as an effect of the context it is found in, that it is recommended to research the effects of the current COVID-19 pandemic.

The renovation policy of 1986 and the introduction of a free and compulsory public education system, examples of those earlier mentioned developments, have had positive results. However, the number of children engaged in economic activity remains high and poverty is stated as the main determinant. It is Kim (2018) who dives deeper into the multidimensional character of poverty explicitly, exploring an intersectional approach. Follow-up research where such an intersectional approach is taken into consideration can provide a greater understanding of the reactional character of various determinants.

Taking a step back, follow-up research could also focus on the continuous discussion on how to define child labour and how to make a distinction between “child labour” and “children engaged in work”. Some sources mention that the latter might even be beneficial and it is needed to further analyse what these benefits are. It is recommended to place this follow-up research in the context of local perspectives on the phenomenon.

When resources discuss the effects of interventions and propose recommendations, it is often related to prevention and elimination of child labour. Research on reintegration plans of child labourers would be a valuable addition.

WNCB focus themes

If it comes to the WNCB focus themes of education, child protection, responsible business and gender, further research mostly needs to be conducted within the educational and responsible businesses themes.

The parental limited education is often presented as determinant in sources discussing the social and economic factors of child labour. This factor however is barely mentioned in the interventions programs discussed and follow-up research on parental inclusion in awareness-raising campaigns could potentially be beneficial. Also, multiple sources mention the positive effects of the Universal Primary Education law (UPE). It is mentioned that these effects are different across families by income, region and ethnicity. It is recommended to dive deeper in why that is the case.

Only recently is there more and more attention on what a responsible business entails. Businesses have their own policies and an analysis of how these could be addressed in relation to governmental policies can be an interesting exploration field. It is recommended to look into the lessons learned of business who have successfully eliminated child labour in their whole supply chain.

WNCB focus sectors

In both the garment and domestic work sector, child trafficking practices have been identified. However, only limited information is provided on the phenomenon and how it ties into the child labour situation in Vietnam. Follow-up research on trafficking will then provides insights into the prevalence of the child labour situation more accurately.

Annotated bibliography

Introduction

Prevalence

1. International labour Organisation, General Statistics Office & Ministry of labour, Invalids and Social Affairs. (2020). *Second National Survey in Child Labour in 2018: Key findings*.

Key words	National survey(s), statistical data on child labour
Source	Report
Description	The article presents data on the prevalence of child labour in Vietnam, gathered through the 2nd national survey conducted by Ministry of labour, War invalids and Social Affairs in collaboration with ILO: In 2018, there were around 1 million children recognized as child labourers in all three economic sectors of the national economy: 60% in agriculture, forestry and fishery, 23% in service and 15.6% in industry and construction. The proportion of child labourers among children 5-17 is 9,1% while the figure for 2012 was 15,1%. School attendance of child labourers has also improved: from 43,5% in 2012 to over 63% in 2018. Vietnam's child labour rate is 2% lower than average of Asia-Pacific region.

History of child labour

2. Ettinger, J. (2013). *Child Work in an Interconnected world: Examining The Impact of Free Trade Policies in Child labour in Bangladesh, Vietnam and Zambia* [Undergraduate thesis, Hofstra University].

Key words	Economic restructure, policies, Vietnam law
Source	Undergraduate thesis
Description	Vietnam benefited from economic restructuring, as its primary staple of rice happened to perform extremely well in the global economy. The majority of the population was involved in the rice trade and household incomes increased enough to send children to school. The author suggests that economic globalisation and the adoption of neoliberal trade reforms potentially had beneficial impacts on children. Moreover, Vietnam's outlawing of child labour in 1988, its establishment of a free and compulsory public education system and ratification of several ILO's Convention regarding child labour also played an important role in this achievement.
Evaluation	Provides further insights on the impact of Vietnam's economic restructuring on the child labour rate.

3. Hindman, H. D. (2015). *The World of Child labour: A Historical and Regional Survey*. Routledge.

Key words	History child labour, history child labour Vietnam
-----------	--

Source	Book
Description	This publication is a historical and regional survey about the global prevalence of child labour. Main aspects about Vietnam are (1) before 1990's child labour in Vietnam was not a priority; (2) Reductions of poverty rates decreased child labour rates; (3) It is necessary to change conception of children's position and value in family and society; (4) Despite the declining trend of child labour, number of children age six to fourteen engaged in economic activity remains high; (5) The shift to a market economy opened the window for child labour in private and informal sectors and (6) while the overall number of child labour is decreasing, children working in the worst form of child labour could be on the rise.
Evaluation	Publication provides detailed information to develop a holistic understanding on the history of child labour in Vietnam.

4. Tran, N. D. (2019, February). The EU-Vietnam Free Trade Agreement: Reflecting on the issue of child labour. *EU-Asia at a Glance*, European Institute for Asian Studies.

Key words	Economic transition
Source	Research paper
Description	This paper states the impact of the economic transition in Vietnam on child labour in the 1990's through the Đổi Mới Policy: from a centralized economy under full control by the government to a market-let state managed economy. This socio-economic overhaul lifted millions of Vietnamese citizens out of destitution and could improve national living standards and subsequent reduction of child labour rate.
Evaluation	Supports the findings of other research on the rather positive effects of the economic transition on child labour.

5. Turk, C. & Edmonds, E. (2002). Child labour in transition in Vietnam. *Policy Research Working Papers*.

Key words	Child labour, history, Vietnam
Source	Policy paper
Description	Explanation on significant reduction of child labour in the 1990's in both rural and urban areas in all regions of the country - except the rural Central Highlands - in all sectors and age groups - except for ethnic minorities age 10 and above - and for both sexes.
Evaluation	Study is praised and often referred to by other authors; qualitative survey.

Social and cultural causes of child labour

6. Basu, K. (2003) The Global Child labour Problem: What Do We Know and What Can We Do?. *The World Bank Economic Review*, 17(2), 147-173.

Key words	Child labour consequences, interventions, intervention policies
Source	Academic journal article
Description	The author does not only explores what gives rise to child labour and what the consequences are, it also explores which interventions might end child labour and concludes that a well-meaning but poorly designed policy can exacerbate poverty in which labouring children live. Also, policies that use punitive actions to enforce labour standards should be approached with caution.
Evaluation	The publication holds policy recommendations.

7. Basu K., Das S. & Dutta, B. (2007). Child labour and household wealth: theory and empirical evidence of an inverted-u. *IZA Discussion Papers, No. 2736*, Institute for the Study of labour (IZA), Bonn.

Key words	Causes, female education as intervention, intervention policies
Source	Discussion paper
Description	The study highlights an important cause of child labour in Vietnam: households with own businesses are more likely to have their children work. It also suggests that female education is twice as effective in reducing child labour when compared to adult male education. Overall, policies fostering the smooth functioning of adult labour markets couples with non-agrarian ways of increasing wealth are likely to be effective tools in reducing child labour.

8. Chi, T. H. (2010). Understanding vulnerability and resilience in the context of poverty and ethnicity in Vietnam. *Children & Society*, 24(4), 315-325.

Key words	Poverty, resilience, social difference
Source	Academic journal article
Description	Ethnographic research in the highlands of Vietnam in 2018 presents that poverty and ethnicity affect children's experience of adversity. The author reflects on how their understanding of social differences is underpinned by local power structures.
Evaluation	While the article is not only dedicated to the topic of child labour, it is valuable as it gives a qualitative view on how children in various Vietnamese regions respond in the context of poverty which is considered as one of the main factors of child labour.

9. Churchill S. A., Smyth R. & Trinh T. A. (2020, May). *The intergenerational impacts of War: Bombings and child labour in Vietnam*.

Key words	Intergenerational impact, Vietnam war
Source	Report
Description	The study indicates that war and the intensity of bombings increase the prevalence of child labour in Vietnam. In particular, the poorest and most vulnerable households are often located in regions with armed conflicts or have been victims of war. When investigating other potential factors, the authors found that economic growth, father's education and poverty mediate the relationship between the war and child labour in Vietnam.
Evaluation	Intergenerational approach and outlining the long-term impacts of the Vietnam war, providing a new perspective.

10. Dutta, G. (2002). *Child labour in Vietnam: The relative importance of poverty, returns to education, labour mobility, and credit constraints*.

Key words	Education return, poverty alleviation
Source	Book
Description	The author outlines various child labour determinants by analyzing the poverty line threshold and by exploring the relationship between education return and child labour. The author recommend poverty alleviations as the most important policy for reducing child labour.
Evaluation	The article can be used as scientific evidence for the evaluation of national and regional policies.

11.1. International labour Organisation. (2009, September). *Report: Working children situation in eight provinces/cities in Vietnam*. Institute of Labour Science and Social Affairs, Research Centre for Female Labour and Gender.

Key words	Awareness, socio-cultural factors
Source	Report
Description	The report points out certain factors contributing to the occurrence of child labour: (1) the number of old people, children and dependent people in a family indicates a shortage of earners; (2) unstable jobs and income insecurities; (3) community and parents awareness where most parents are not aware about children's rights. The awareness among the working children employers was also low.

12. Kim, H. (2018). Beyond Monetary Poverty Analysis: The Dynamics of Multidimensional Child Poverty in developing countries. *Social Indicators Research*, 141(3), 1107-1136.

Key words	Monetary poverty, multidimensional poverty, poverty dynamics
Source	Academic Journal article
Description	The study investigates transitions in monetary and multidimensional poverty using the 2006 and 2009 young live surveys in Ethiopia, India, Peru, and Vietnam. It points out that poverty dynamics have been studied through the lens of monetary poverty with little attention to the dynamics of child poverty. The study defines that a poverty dynamic analysis may describe how poverty severity and deprivation depth changes over time. In conclusion, children remaining in monetary poverty are more likely to stay in multidimensional poverty and that children escaping monetary poverty do not always exit multidimensional poverty.
Evaluation	One of the main values of the study is the final suggestion, which stresses the need to go beyond traditional monetary poverty indicators to understand and monitor poverty dynamics among children. This is of great importance since poverty is a robust determinant of child labour.

13. Kneebone, S., Yea, S., Ligam, M., Tran, T. T. K., Nguyen, H. T. & Dinh, Q. T. N. (2013). *Child labour & Migration: From Hue to Saigon, Vietnam*. Monash University.

Key words	Awareness, education, lack of knowledge
Source	Report
Description	Several motivations for sending children to work identified in this study are family structure and the children's wishes. In particular, children with poor school records, or those who are uninterested in school or cannot afford education costs, tend to drop out of school for work. Those under family difficulties (may be due to large-sized families) also work early to share the financial burden with their parents. What remains challenging in child labour elimination efforts is the lack of knowledge about the risks of child labour existed in both parents and children themselves.
Evaluation	This study is useful as it shows a demographic cause of child labour that is very common in Vietnam: large-sized families has long been a significant factor for poverty, leading to the incident of child labour.

14. Morgan, P. J. & Long, T. Q. (2018). *Heterogeneous effects of migration on child welfare: Empirical evidence from Viet Nam*. Asian Development Bank Institute.

Key words	Education, migration
Source	Report
Description	This study provides heterogeneous effects of migration on left-

behind children's education and child labour in Vietnam. In particular, migration does not appear to directly affect children's schooling decision, but might negatively affect their time spent working, which ultimately affects their schooling decision. Migration, however, may also positively affect household per capita income in some respects, therefore it also indirectly affects child education and child labour, sometimes in a positive way. A thing to note is that different types of migration have different effects on child schooling and labour.

Evaluation Since migration is one of the main contributor to child labour, studies on their relationship is of great importance in targeting policies. Especially as the policies on migration requires tactful consideration where the effects on child labour vary with different types of migration.

15. Toh, Y. L. (2018). The role of land wealth on child labour in Vietnam. *Atlantic Economic Journal*, 46(2), 247-248.

Key words Land law, poverty hypothesis, wealth paradox

Source Academic journal article

Description While empirical evidence support the poverty hypothesis of greater land wealth leads to higher child labour rate, this paper hypothesizes that the wealth paradox of child labour is present in Vietnam post-1993, after introducing the 1993 land law redistributing land rights, and subsequently allowed households to own land as assets and stored wealth.

Evaluation This paper is important because it makes a specific call to policy makers to revise the 1993 Vietnamese Land Law with the aim to consider how agrarian households used child labour to deal with market imperfections.

16. Trinh, T. A., Posso, A. & Feeny, S. (2019). Child labour and rainfall deviation: Panel data evidence from rural Vietnam. *The Developing Economies*, 58(1), 63-76.

Key words Agriculture, environmental shocks, policy-making, rainfall deviations

Source Academic journal article

Description This paper explains how rainfall shocks to the agricultural sector can pull children into agricultural work and/or household chores. This is problematic because both forms of child work are potentially precarious. It examines the relationship between rainfall deviations and child labour for rural households in Vietnam using panel data covering the period 2006-14, classifying child labour into agricultural and non-agricultural activities as well as household chores. The authors findings suggest that intra-household experiences of exogenous weather shocks are likely to vary at the individual level, suggesting a need for a more tailored approach to policy making.

Evaluation	This paper is important because it explains a quite specific phenomenon inside agriculture activities and calls for more tailored policies in order to protect children in all potentially harmful circumstances.
------------	---

17.1. Understanding Children's Work. (2008). *Understanding children's work in Vietnam - Report on Child labour*.

Key words	Education, place of residence, socio-cultural causes, water access
Source	Report
Description	The article outlines social and cultural causes of child labour. Within education, the educational level of the household heads, the access to post-primary education in rural areas and school quality can have an influence. There is also the households' perceptions of life quality and the place of residence: children living in the rural southeast and northwest regions face higher risk of work and denied schooling. Finally, water access might allow adults more time for other productive activities making income from children less necessary.

WNCB focus themes

Education and child labour

18. Becker, J. (2017). *Campaigning for children strategies for advancing children's rights*. California, US: Stanford University Press.

Key words	Anti child labour activism, poverty
Source	Book
Description	Core message of the book is the role of activism as a key element in transforming children's lives, including child labour. Vietnam is mentioned as an example on the interlinkedness of poverty and child labour.

19. Chen, S. (2018). Education and transition to work: Evidence from Vietnam, Cambodia and Nepal. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 61, 92-105.

Key words	NEET, Out-of-school children, school enrollment
Source	Academic journal article
Description	This study examines labour market outcomes among children and youth in Vietnam, Cambodia and Nepal. In all countries examined, out-of-school children with less than primary education do not have a greater chance of entering paid, stable and long-term employment

than their counterparts who are still in school. Even though the vast majority of the early school leavers might be able to enter the labour market in the long run, they have higher risks of transitioning ‘too early’ and are likely to remain NEET (Not in Education, Employment or Training).

20. Ghosh, D. (2020). *Parents, Children, and an End to Child Labour: Is Conditional Cash transfer (CCT) the solution?* [Ph.D. dissertation, Fielding Graduate University].

Key words	Conditional cash transfer
Source	Ph.D. dissertation
Description	A research following the aim to understand how parents and children would respond to conditional cash transfer (CCT) programs as a strategy to reduce child labour. The principal condition for this kind of CCT program is to keep children in school. The research was elaborated using data from a rural location of India called West Bengal. The author concludes that CCT programs require three complementary interventions: improving educational infrastructure, implementing social awareness programs about education and implementing an economic policy able to absorb educated youths.
Evaluation	Even though the research was conducted in rural India, it's useful for future interventions in specific provinces of Vietnam, especially when it recommends that education is what CCT programs should target.

21.1. ILO Vietnam Country Office. (2019). *Report on National Strategic Planning Workshop and Preparatory Thematic Workshop for Alliance 8.7 in Vietnam.*

Key words	Educational challenges
Source	Report
Description	The report outlines specific challenges for the prevention of child labour in the context of education including (1) a lack of accessibility of schools; (2) children with disabilities who are discouraged from attending school; (3) stigma attached to vocational training centers; (4) lack of interest in school due to disengaging curricula; (5) little to no career orientation provided to students and (6) vocational training services do not meet the needs of students.
Evaluation	The report is very important as it has listed specific challenges for the prevention of child labour in the context of education,

21.2. International labour Organisation. (2009, September). *Report: Working children situation in eight provinces/cities in Vietnam.*

Key words	Working children, schooling situation of children, schooling situation of parents
Source	Report

Description	There are various profiles of working children in the study sites and presents multiple findings on the schooling situation, participation in vocational training and career orientation and on parent's education level. Respectively, it concludes that children from ethnic minorities, migrating children and girls need the most attention, that youth children are left without proper career guidance and that the educational level of parents of working children is remarkably lower than that of non-working children's parents.
-------------	---

22. Kneebone, S., Yea, S., Ligam, M., Tran, T. T. K., Nguyen, H. T., & Dinh, Q. T. N. (2013). *Child labour & Migration: From Hue to Saigon, Vietnam*. Monash University.

Key words	Parental education
-----------	--------------------

Source	Report
--------	--------

Description	Although this study only focuses on the groups of children migrating for work from Hue to Saigon, it shows a high correlation between parental education and the probability of children's premature work, therefore successfully identifies one of the root causes of child labour which is parents' limited education.
-------------	--

23. Luong, V. (2011). *How can child labour lead to an increase in human capital of child labourers and what are policy implications?* [Ph.D. dissertation, University of California, Berkeley].

Key words	Human capital, positive causal impacts
-----------	--

Source	Ph.D. dissertation
--------	--------------------

Description	The dissertation attempts to answer three critical questions that have remained largely misunderstood in the literature of child labour. Firstly, whether child labour can help child labourers gain more human capital. Secondly, how a positive causal impact from child labour to human capital can possibly take place and, thirdly, what are the unintended consequences of current policies and what can we do to effectively combat child labour and at the same time help child labourers acquire more human capital? This is the first study to provide empirical evidence that child labour can lead to an increase in the human capital of child labourers.
-------------	--

24. Morrow, V. & Boyden, J. (2018). *Responding to children's work: Evidence from the Young Lives study in Ethiopia, India, Peru and Vietnam*. Oxford: Young Lives.

Key words	Ethnic minority groups, education
-----------	-----------------------------------

Source	Report
--------	--------

Description	This study highlights that ethnic minority children in Vietnam were teased by classmates and often felt unwelcome in school. Additionally, they experienced negative impacts resulting from
-------------	---

language of instruction in Vietnamese schools as they did not have the language of instruction as a first language.

Evaluation This study is helpful as it points out the major problems that can discourage ethnic children from pursuing school and may lead to the incident of child labour.

25. Ngo, A. P. (2018). *Essays on Women's Fertility, Education, and Female Labour Supply in Vietnam* [Ph.D. dissertation, University of Illinois at Chicago].

Key words UPE law

Source Ph.D. dissertation

Description The dissertation explores the Universal Primary Education (UPE) law that was passed by the government in 1991 to increase school enrolment and required every child aged 6 to enrol in a primary school. The effects of the UPE policy may vary across families by income, region and ethnicity. Even though the increase of school enrollment was high in higher income families, in the rural areas (poorest families) is still an issue to send children to schools

Evaluation This source is important because remarks the value of education as a key factor to decrease child labour in Vietnam and demands different policies attention targeted at different families, regions and ethnicity.

26. Putnick, D. L. & Bornstein, M. H. (2015). Is child labour a barrier to school enrollment in low- and middle-income countries? *International Journal of Educational Development*, 41, 112-120.

Key words Insufficient teaching, poor-quality school, school enrollment

Source Academic journal article

Description Employing 186,795 families with 7- to 14-year-old children in 30 low and middle income to explore child work outside the home, family work and household chores, the authors find that significant negative relations emerged between each form of child labour and school enrolment, but relations were more consistent for family work and household chores than work outside the home. They also indicate that poor-quality schools and insufficient teaching staff have also discouraged many families from sending their children to schools.

Evaluation The study is helpful in the sense that it explains the vicious circle, in which child labour is the cause and effect of school absence, similar to the case of poverty.

27.1. Quach, Q. T. (2017, July 4). Prevention against child labour in the strategy of child protection, care and education. *Ministry of labour, Invalids and Social Affairs, Institute of labour Science and Social Affairs*. <http://ilssa.org.vn/en/news/prevention-against-child-labour-in-the-strategy-of-child-protection-care-and-education-196>.

Key words	Child labour vs. volunteering
Source	Research paper
Description	This paper demands a clear clarification on the differences between forced labour to earn a living and children's volunteering to do work, which is suitable for their health and domestic conditions. In order to achieve this, we need to understand law thoroughly and avoid depriving children's opportunities of vocational education or working to improve their knowledge and experiences.

17.2 Understanding Children's Work. (2008). *Understanding children's work in Vietnam - Report on Child labour*.

Key words	Education, school life expectancy
Source	Report
Description	This report views child labour as a barrier to achieving education for all. School life expectancy offers additional evidence of the negative impact of children's work on secondary education. Limited evidence suggests that children's economic activity not only affects their ability to attend school but also their ability to perform effectively once there. Those children, whose academic performance often lags behind that of their same-aged peers, have less opportunity to catch up.

Child protection and child labour

28. Burr, R. (2006). *Vietnam's children in a Changing World*. New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press.

Key words	Child labour in Vietnam, effects
Source	Book
Description	A complete study about childhood in Vietnam that dedicates a chapter to child labour. The author mentions that researchers have begun to recognize that most attention has focused on the detrimental effects on children's lives of experiences such as working and poverty. However, the author points out that we should start acknowledging children's own capabilities and resilience.
Evaluation	The reflection of the author is interesting because it makes a call for leaving the understanding of this topic under a Western point of view, mostly close to the abolition approach; she concludes that while there are places where it remains normal and traditional for children to work, it does not mean that they are entitled to be unfairly exploited.

29. Fenton-Glynn, C. (2019). *Children's rights and sustainable development interpreting the UNCRC for future generations* (Treaty implementation for sustainable development). Cambridge University Press.

Key words	Globalisation, sustainable development
Source	Book
Description	This book is dedicated to how to identify children as subjects of development, exploring how their rights can be respected, protected and promoted while also ensuring the economic, social and environmental sustainability of our planet. Even though the topic of child labour is not directly addressed, there is a chapter that explains the complex relationship between childrens' rights protection and the liberalisation of international trade, presenting the intersection of the obligations adopted in various treaties as a key mechanism to adopt a sophisticated approach which advocated for the fulfilment of the best interest of the child.

30. Giang, L. T., Nguyen, C. V., Tran, T. Q. & Thieu, V. (2016). Does firm agglomeration matter to Labour and education of local children? Evidence in Vietnam. *Child Indicators Research*, 10(4), 1015-1041.

Key words	Agglomeration and child labour
source	Academic journal article
Description	This article examines the effects of the firm agglomeration on education and labour for local children. Although the firm agglomeration does not have direct significant effects on school enrolment, the authors find that firm agglomeration: (1) have effects in improving school quality, (2) reduce the probabilities to work for children, and (3) have a larger effect on girls than boys. The authors finally propose policy directions to enhance child education and reduce child labour: (1) promote the development of firms providing jobs for local people, especially in disadvantageous areas, an (2) stronger policies to promote children's education, where CCT might be more effective.
Evaluation	It is a source that provides, from an economic point of view, valuable analysis and recommendations for policy makers in Vietnam.

11.3. International labour Organisation. (2009, September). *Report: Working children situation in eight provinces/cities in Vietnam*. Institute of Labour Science and Social Affairs, Research Centre for Female Labour and Gender.

Key words	Effects of child labour
Source	Report
Description	There are various effects of premature working on children, ranging from effects on their health and physical development, their

education, their social and cognitive development. In terms of working hours and working conditions, working children mainly work in the informal economic sector. Therefore, standards for working environments, labour safety and sanitation are difficult to control and to safeguard. Moreover, children also have to suffer from physiological pressure at work. Most working children are not equipped with safe working instruments.

31. McClanahan, S. & Gelders, B. (2019, May 20). *Assessing the potential for multi-tiered child benefits in Vietnam: A policy brief*. ILO Country Office for Vietnam.

Key words	Child labour elimination, multi-tiered child benefits, social assistance system, social protection
Source	Policy paper
Description	The paper evaluates positive outcomes of multi-tiered child benefits for child labour elimination and child protection processes. Such benefits can act as an incentive for workers to join social security while at the same time ensuring children's basic rights to social protection. In particular, ensuring social insurance/security coverage, especially for the so-called "missing middle" who are struggling but tend to be forgotten from the current social assistance system, has a great impact on the possibility of child labour and the enjoyment of children's rights and benefits

32. Nguyen, V. D. & Anh, M. N. (2018). Does governmental microcrediting benefit child labour in the poorest regions? New evidence from a transitional economy. *Economics & Sociology*, 11(3), 333-344.

Key words	Credit access
Source	Academic journal article
Description	This paper identified that credit access decreases the child labour rate. However, there are also results showing that access to credit only decreases the probability of child labour for households with income per capita greater than 812 thousand VND (approximately 40 USD). The author's findings imply that policies of relaxation of credit constraints for households may not be effective unless accompanied by the strategies to help households overcome the minimum thresholds of income, promoting children welfare.
Evaluation	The source is relevant because it calls for the necessity of a sociological view of the economic interventions to reduce child labour.

33. Phan, T. L. P. (2014). Prevention of Child labour Abuse contribute to promote the implementation of children's rights in Vietnam. *Vietnam National University Science Journal: Law*, 30(4), 58-64.

Key words	Child labour vs. children engaged in work
Source	Academic journal article
Description	This study has clearly differentiate “child labour” and “children engaged in work”. According to the author, not every child engaged in work is considered child labour. Children engaged in work are those who do work that does not harm physical development, learning and play; can contribute to the healthy development of children. The study also points out challenges in the fight against child labour in the context of children’s right protection, and call for the establishment of a safe and friendly environment for child labour in order to eliminate or minimize risks of vulnerability to children that might push them to the labour market at an early age.

27.2. Quach, Q. T. (2017, July 4). *Prevention against child labour in the strategy of child protection, care and education*. Ministry of labour, Invalids and Social Affairs, Institute of labour Science and Social Affairs.

Key words	Child protection, law on child labour
Source	Research paper
Description	This paper, apart from providing certain advantages of the Vietnamese law on child labour and child protection, also requests child labour and child protection to be addressed with flexibility, meaning that we should place great importance on enforcing law, simultaneously create opportunities of vocational education, of working to relieve their families’ financial burdens and ensuring their own lives. Moreover, poverty, rapid population increase in big cities, migration, urbanization and industrialization in urban areas are contributing to an increase in child labour employment, which should be taken into consideration when implementing policies.

17.3. Understanding Children's Work. (2008). *Understanding children’s work in Vietnam - Report on Child labour*.

Key words	Child labour abuse, prevention
Source	Report
Description	The report provides solutions that are suitable for Vietnam’s context: preventive measures for those at risk of child labour e.g. reducing household vulnerability, reducing barriers to school access, raising awareness and neasues for those who have already been engaged in child labour e.g. providing a second change education; removal, recovery and reintegration and to introduce community based monitoring mechanism.

34. Giao, V.C., Khoi, N.V. & Lai, C.T. (2021). The Relationship Between Child Legal Age, Children’s Rights, Education for Children, and Child labour: Reflection from the Vietnamese Context, *Psychology and Education Journal*, 58(5).

Key words	CRC, legal age, protection children's right
Source	Academic journal article
Description	This paper analyses the relationship between the regulation of the legal age of children and the protection of children's rights. They reveal the connection between the low child legal age and the high rate of child labour in the Vietnamese children group aged 16-17, who are no longer benefiting from the state's social policies for children. In addition, the authors prove that raising the legal age of children to be in line with the CRC's (Convention of the Rights of the Child) regulation is appropriate and very necessary for Vietnam today.

Responsible business and child labour

35. Götzmann, N. (2019). *Handbook on human rights impact assessment* (Research Handbooks on Impact Assessment Series). Cheltenham, Gloucestershire: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

Key words	Children's rights, human rights, impact assessment
Source	Book
Description	This handbook addresses the topic of human rights impact assessment (HRIA) in the context of business and human rights. Chapter 7 of the handbook, elaborated by Tara M. Collins, is entitled "Children's rights in HRIA: Marginalised or mainstreamed?" and is based on two questions: (1) how are children's rights relevant to business activities, including human rights due diligence and impact assessment? And (2) what guidance exists to support assessment of the impact of business upon child rights in practice?. The chapter concludes that the full range of children's rights should be included in HRIAs, extending beyond child labour to the positive and negative effects of business.

36. Hong, R. H. (2013). Helping Child Workers: How should multinational corporations accommodate child workers in Southeast Asian countries to which they outsource?. *Syracuse University Honours Program Capstone Projects*. 86.

Key words	Child labour elimination, corporate responsibility, social responsibility
Source	Working paper
Description	In this study, the writer points out the problem of the policy of child labour elimination, arguing that it is not a true meaning of social responsibility because child workers will search for alternative jobs that might provide worse working conditions. Several suggested solutions characterized as true social responsibility are (1) build private schools right next to the factories; (2) change corporate culture by looking out for child workers' best interests, in this case to make sure they are treated fairly at work, not exploited by the

suppliers, and getting the proper education that they deserve; (3) make social changes and (4) weigh costs and benefits of child labour use to make the right decisions.

37. Hoang, D. & Jones, B. (2012). Why do corporate codes of conduct fail? Women Workers and clothing supply chains in Vietnam. *Global Social Policy*, 12(1), 67-85.

Key words	Business conduct, CoC
Source	Academic journal article
Description	<p>Through analytical interrogation of existing literature and empirical evidence from Vietnamese case studies, the study explains the poor performance of CoCs. It is argued, firstly, that the extent of the control of multinational corporations over their subcontracting suppliers is misconceived and overestimated because supply chains function more like networks than the hierarchies. Moreover, the factory workers, their subcontractor employers, intermediary vendors and even the multinational corporations seeking CoCs commitments, have convergent interests in violating key aspects of the codes.</p> <p>The study also suggests solutions for CoCs to be effective: (1) CoCs being accompanied by fuller recognition and strengthening of workers' collective voice; (2) report mechanism to customers; (3) lower and middle-tier suppliers comprehensively incorporating the most significant labour standards checks into the more frequent and rigorous quality control inspections and (4) inter-business agreements reducing economic pressures on supplier firms for organisational integrity.</p>

21.2. ILO Vietnam Country Office. (2019). *Report on National Strategic Planning Workshop and Preparatory Thematic Workshop for Alliance 8.7 in Vietnam*.

Key words	Challenges child labour elimination
Source	Report
Description	<p>Outlines challenges and limitations of existing mechanisms to prevent child labour: (1) difficulty of detecting; (2) limited dialogue between business associations; (3) fraudulent documentation and (4) no inspections without permission from local government. The authors also outline priorities for improvement: (1) establish a national child labour and business forum involving small, medium enterprises and big brand; (2) provide targeted economic opportunities and social benefits to families of child labourers in need and (3) implement awareness-raising programmes using social media targeting both private and public sector.</p>

38. Nguyen, T. T. H., Tromp, D. & O'Connell, S. (2020, October). *Preliminary assessment of the regulatory framework on responsible business practice in Vietnam*. UNDP, The Vietnamese Ministry of Justice, The Government of Sweden.

Key words	Business responsibility, challenges
Source	Report
Description	This paper identifies several problems that can be obstacles for responsible business practice in Vietnam which are (1) a lack of a clear, official, consistent definition of child labour in legal documents and institutional framework; (2) in other areas of law such as trade, business, and the environment, the protection of children is rarely addressed and (3) a lack of a legal framework on the responsibility of business to respect the rights of children in the marketplace, in the local community and in the context of ensuring a clean and healthy environment for children.

39. Responsible Business for Children. (2019). *Survey: Children's Rights and Business Principles (CRBP) at Work in Vietnam*. <http://crbp.com.vn/en/completed/6-key-findings-from-the-survey-on-children-s-rights-and-business-principles-at-workplace-in-viet-nam>.

Key words	Business responsibility, child protection
Source	Report
Description	101 businesses provided insights in their efforts to commit to protection of childrens' rights in Vietnam, where focusing on the three main industries of textile and footwear, tourism and travel, and ICT. The survey show compliancy with the Child Labour Prevention, while there are still limited legal job opportunities and support for child labourers.

40. Türkelli Gamze Erdem. (2020). *Children's rights and business: Governing Obligations and responsibility*. Cambridge University Press.

Key words	Childrens' rights approach, polycentric governance, regulatory framework
Source	Book
Description	This book follows the inquiry into existing hard and soft law regulatory frameworks on children's rights and business, considering the case of globalised business transactions using a children 's rights perspective. Even though this book does not consider specific economic activities in Vietnam, it does define what is a polycentric governance model of children's rights and business. In polycentric governance, regulatory authority does not reside exclusively, or sometimes at all, with the state. Both states and non-state entities have the capacity to make decisions, produce norms and implementation strategies. This approach relies on responsibility more than on obligation (of all actors involved in the supply chain) and provides diverse scenarios where states and all business actors could be accountable, considering their specific role in the supply chain and the potential risk to children's rights.

Gender and child labour

41. Edmonds, E. (2004). *Household composition and the response of child labour supply to Product Market Integration: Evidence from Vietnam*. Policy Research Working Papers, No. WPS 3235 Washington, D.C: World Bank Group.

Key words	Gender difference, rice producing households, sibling difference
Source	Working paper
Description	This paper presents that the increase in rice prices in the 1990's are associated with a decline in child labour. The paper also presents various findings on sibling difference in relation to child labour: elder siblings are more productive and therefore have to work more substantially than their younger siblings. Also, girls generally work more than boys.

42. Glewwe, P., Agrawal, N. & Dollar, D. (2004). Economic growth, poverty, and household welfare in Vietnam. *World Bank Regional and Sectoral Studies*. Washington: World Bank Publications.

Key words	GDP, gender inequality, poverty
Source	Book
Description	The authors follow the perspective that global variation of child labour can be explained by GDP per capita alone. The qualitative and quantitative work presented in the chapter suggest that children still working in Vietnam are doing so because their families are too poor to support the basic needs of the family without the children's economic contribution. Also, the result of the research shows that girls are more likely to work than boys, making them more vulnerable under economic stress.

43. Nguyen, T. H. (2016, April 22). *Gender ideologies toward division of household labour in contemporary Vietnam*. Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affairs, Institute of Labour Science and Social Affairs. <http://ilssa.org.vn/en/news/gender-ideologies-toward-division-of-household-labour-in-contemporary-vietnam-197>.

Key words	Gender ideology, gender roles
Source	Research paper
Description	Drawing on qualitative data collected from in-depth interviews with 6 men and 6 women of various demographic features in Vietnam, the author showed how household labour has mainly been regulated by a gender-role ideology. Despite women's higher educational attainments, increasing participation in the labour market and men's greater engagement in doing domestic chores and child tending, Vietnamese women are still doing a majority of housework and highly

expected to fulfil their traditional role as mothers in addition to another modern role as employees.

Evaluation Although this paper did not directly mention the issue of child labour, it is still helpful when providing an explanation of the causes of the gender preference in child domestic work which is gender ideologies perpetuated in Vietnamese society.

44. Nguyen, B. N. & Gordon, M. (2020, August 6). Human trafficking and gender inequality in remote communities of central Vietnam. *Journal of Social Change*, 12(1), 134-150.

Key words Confucianism, gender roles

Source Academic journal article

Description As Vietnam is a patriarchal society with a Confucian-influenced social system, daughters are more often responsible for household chores and are the first ones to be sent to help the family's economic difficulties. This phenomenon is even more prevalent in remote communities of central Vietnam where school accessibility and education costs are great obstacles for children's right to study.

45. Obermann, G., Hoang Oanh, N. & Hong Ngoc, N. (2020). Gender pay gap in Vietnam: A propensity score matching analysis. *Journal of Economics and Development*, 23(3), 238-253.

Key words Gender bias, gender inequality, pay gap

Source Academic journal article

Description Evidence suggests that there exists a statistically significant pay gap and inequality between comparable groups of male and female earners. Accordingly, the writers suggested that policies aimed at narrowing gender inequality in labour income are effective only when taking into account both observable characteristics and unobservable factors such as gender differences that determines wages and gender discrimination in pay.

46. O'Donnell, O. A., Rosati, F. C. & van Doorslaer, E. (2004). Health effects of child work: Evidence from rural Vietnam. *Journal of Population Economics*, 18(3), 437-467.

Key words Gender difference, health effects

Source Academic journal article

Description Research on the impact of agricultural child labour on health. Three indicators of health were examined: weight for age, reported illness and height growth. There was little evidence of a contemporaneous negative impact of agricultural child work on health but, particularly for females, work undertaken during childhood raises risk of illness up to five years later.

47. Satriawan, E. & Ghifari, A. T. (2018, February). *How does parental income affect child labour supply: Evidence from the Indonesia Family Life Survey*. TNP2K Working Paper 2 - 2018. Jakarta, Indonesia.

Key words	Gender roles, policy
Source	Working paper
Description	The working paper presents that the mothers' income and child labour have statistically significant relationship for children in the rural areas. Hence, the authors argue that policies aiming at banning child labour indiscriminately without addressing the root causes of child labour would help neither the children nor the households. An alternative could be to implement policies to lessen child labour should focus on improving mother's welfare.

17.4. Understanding Children's Work. (2008). *Understanding children's work in Vietnam - Report on Child labour*.

Key words	Gender difference in economic activities, child labour
Source	Report
Description	The report suggests that gender plays a relatively minor role in the child labour phenomenon in Vietnam: the share of boys and girls aged 6-14 in economic activity is almost equal. Also, working girls and boys differ little in terms of the nature of their economic activities (i.e., work sector and work modality) and in terms of the amount of time they spend performing them. However, gender considerations do appear to play a role in parents' decisions concerning whether to involve their children in school or work. Boys appear to have a double disadvantage in this context, facing a greater risk of both work and denied schooling may be due to their usefulness in work that requires strength.
Evaluation	The report provides a different perspective than other research on the topic.

48. Weimann-Sandig, N. (2020, November). Gender disparities in Vietnam's labour market: Australia - World Bank Group Strategic Partnership in Vietnam Gender Theme. *World Bank Discussion Paper*.

Key words	Gender bias, gender stereotyping
Source	Discussion paper
Description	In this paper, the authors point out two of the most significant signs of gender inequality in child labour. Firstly, parents with strong gender stereotyping play a significant role in determining a daughter's life path. These stereotypes have been so deep-rooted that they are not disputed by the young women's focus groups. Second, teachers and employers hold gender biases that affect how

they treat students and employees in vocational education programs and at the workplace.

WNCB focus sectors

Garment, textile and footwear

49. Better Work Vietnam. (2019, June). *Better Work Vietnam Annual Report 2019: An Apparel Industry and Compliance Review*.

Key words	Compliance review, Zero Tolerance Protocol
Source	Report
Description	This report is based on a review of 331 factories in Vietnam from Jan 1, 2017 to June 30, 2018. The results are positive, with only 1% of non-compliance rate. Two detected cases were handled in accordance with the programme's "Zero Tolerance Protocol". Cases of child labour in Better Work Vietnam factories are few and far between, and usually involve either workers that are just below the legal age of employment, or those who are old enough to work but are subject to specific legal rules on their working conditions as juveniles.

50. Better Work Vietnam. (2020). *Annual Report: A Decade of Empowering Workers and Driving Business*.

Key words	Child labour prevalence in textile industry
Source	Report
Description	This report presents the current state of compliance based on the results of the assessment at 295 textile enterprises. Similar to previous years, the use of child or minor workers in hazardous work is rare in participating businesses. 0% of enterprises use employees under 15 years old. 4% of enterprises do not comply with the record keeping of employees under 18 years of age.

51. Buchanan, F. R., Anwar, S. T. & Tran, T. X. (2012). Spotlight on an emerging market: Assessing the footwear and apparel industries in Vietnam. *Global Business and Organisational Excellence*, 32(2), 38-51.

Key words	Child labour documentation, footwear industry
Source	Academic journal article
Description	The article explains how the footwear and apparel industries owned by multinational corporations influenced the development of the economic growth of Vietnam. Despite the fact that in 2011 the ILO did not find evidence of child labour in large factories; the author

mentions that investigators noted that in small companies age documentation was not being checked and worker protections were weak.

52. Do, Q. C. (2020). Social and economic upgrading in the garment supply chain in Vietnam. *IPE Working Papers*. Berlin, Germany: Hochschule für Wirtschaft und Recht Berlin, Institute for International Political Economy (IPE).

Key words	Child labour prevalence in garment and textile industry
Source	Working paper
Description	This paper demonstrates the alarming situation of child labour in the garment and textile industry by recalling the 2014 Survey by ILO and GSO, which found that there were over 41 thousand unregistered child workers in the textile and garment industry, mostly between 15-17 years old and 79% are girls. It also affirms that this industry is the second biggest absolute employer of child labour in the industrial sector after construction, with 2,35% of workers employed being children.

11.4. International labour Organisation. (2009, September). *Report: Working children situation in eight provinces/cities in Vietnam*. Institute of Labour Science and Social Affairs, Research Centre for Female Labour and Gender.

Key words	Hazardous environment, footwear production facilities
Source	Report
Description	This report presents that children working in private garment factories in eight provinces/cities in Vietnam had to suffer from hazardous environments (cramped and oppressive working environment with lack of breathing-air, high temperature); hardness (long working hours, inflexible working positions) and dangers (stressful work, being easily thrown by needles and lack of family care).

53. Köksal, D., Strähle, J. & Müller, M. (2018). Social Sustainability in apparel supply chains—the role of the sourcing intermediary in a developing country. *Sustainability*, 10(4), 1039.

Key words	Apparel sourcing intermediaries, social management strategies,
Source	Academic journal article
Description	The aim of the study is to understand the role of apparel sourcing intermediaries for the implementation of social management strategies based on the perception of multiple supply chain actors. The social sustainability issues in the apparel industry identified by the authors include low wages, overtime work, child labour and

health and safety into its buyer driven characteristics. One of the conclusions of the study is that, from the apparel retailer's point of view, the intermediary can be described as a safeguard for a sociable responsible supply chain. As a consequence, the apparel sourcing intermediary takes over the role of a social risk manager.

Evaluation This source makes a clear call for specific interventions (focused on sourcing intermediaries in order to reduce the issues identified in the apparel industry in developing countries like Vietnam).

54. Mamic, I. (2005). Managing Global Supply Chain: The Sports Footwear, Apparel and Retail Sectors. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 59(1/2), 81-100.

Key words CoC, management systems, multinational enterprises

Source Academic journal article

Description Paper provides a summary of the management systems used by multinational enterprises with the Code of Conduct (CoC). Aim of the CoC is to set guidelines on a range of issues, including child labour. Regarding the role of different groups in CoC implementation, it is mentioned under the purchasing/manufacturing aspect that having expatriate managers (Korean managers in Vietnam for example) is related to little understanding of local culture or respect for local workers. The article concludes that the implementation of the CoC should be governed by policies that involve a permanent dialogue between employer's, workers and government representatives.

Evaluation The source is important as it explains how the implementation of the CoC should be processed with the active participation of all relevant actors involved in the supply chain.

55. Nadvi, K., Thoburn, J., Thang, B. T., Ha, N. T., Hoa, N. T. & Le, D. H. (2004). Challenges to Vietnamese firms in the world garment and textile value chain, and the implications for alleviating poverty. *Journal of the Asia Pacific Economy*, 9(2), 249-267.

Key words Globalisation, textile industry

Source Academic journal article

Description The document presents the global challenges that Vietnamese firms need to face, as part of the global challenges under the new economic international context (globalisation). One of the mentioned challenges is to comply with the international labour standards. US and EU markets are two of the main ones for the Vietnamese industries, and in those markets, customers care about labour standards related to the product they are consuming. To fulfil the international labour standards, the Vietnamese government adopted national policies but also textile and garments firms had to comply with the individual company codes framed by the ILO's labour standards.

56. Responsible Business for Children. (2019). *Survey: Children's Rights and Business Principles (CRBP) at Work in Vietnam*.

Key words	Business responsibility, childrens' rights, textile industry
Source	Report
Description	The survey collected responses from 101 businesses in an effort to provide insight and guidance on what companies/businesses can do to respect and commit to the protection of children's rights in Vietnam.

57. Slot, P. (2017, July). *To what extent are fashion companies violating fundamental labour rights in Turkish and Vietnamese garment factories, and how can such violations be prevented?* [Undergraduate thesis, Tilburg University].

Key words	Garment and textile industry, subcontracting factories
Source	Undergraduate thesis
Description	<p>This paper states that Vietnam is one of six countries that is on the list of products that are made with forced and child labour. It often occurs in subcontracting factories, which supply to larger factories and are often not monitored well. This is a warning to Vietnam's garment and textile industry: if it aims at expanding to foreign market, it should respect and commit to child protection in general and child labour elimination in particular.</p> <p>When suggesting appropriate solutions for Vietnam, the writer also lists certain problems that need to be solved: (1) insufficient establishment of regulations; (2) lack of social protection and benefits and (3) lack of encouragement/cooperation for NGOs to investigate the situation.</p>

58. Sreedharan, L. & Kapoor, A. (2019). *Sitting on pins and needles: A rapid assessment of labour conditions in Vietnam's garment sector*. Embode for Anti-Slavery International.

Key words	Garment industries, labour rights violations
Source	Report
Description	This study assessed working conditions in export-oriented textile and garment industries in Vietnam, and the risk of labour rights violations, including forced labour, child labour and child slavery. It points out fundamental problems: (1) child labour is not found in Tier 1 manufacturing operations, but it still exists sporadically in Tier 4 ones, which provide piece-work for larger factories. Children there were made to work in slave-like conditions without any payment, in line with the "worst forms of child labour"; (2) there is a culture of secrecy in this sector, meaning that there still exists an overall pattern of non-responses, lack of engagement and overall refusal to allow access to factories and workers, creating a barrier to effective

communication and information sharing.

59. Stop Child labour. (2012). *Child labour in the Leather Footwear Industry: An overview and assessment of policies and implementation of 28 footwear companies.*

Key words	Child labour detection, footwear industry
Source	Report
Description	The paper points out challenges in detecting and tackling child labour in the footwear industry. First, there is a lack of transparency since most shoe companies were not prepared to provide information about where and by whom shoes are produced, nor about their strategy to deal with child labour. Second, very few companies have a complete overview of their entire supply chain and even fewer were working to prevent or tackle child labour and other labour violations in their entire production chain. Child labour seems to occur much less frequently in the factories that supply directly to European brands and shops, but is still existent at the medium sized factories and small production units.

60. UNICEF Vietnam. (2017, June). *The Apparel and Footwear Sector and Children in Vietnam.*

Key words	Apparel industry, informal labour, left- behind children, supply chain
Source	Report
Description	Child labourers in these two industries - apparel and footwear sector - are rare, however minor workers aged 15-17, employed to work like adults, is an issue that requires special concerns. Due to the low tolerance of child labour in formal sectors of these industries, the problem is pushed to the lower tiers of the whole supply chain, for instance subcontracting factories and in informal, home-based workshops. The risk of premature work is particularly high among left-behind children. This also indicates a lack of vocational education and training activities and proper job opportunities for those aged 15-17.

61. United States Department of State, Bureau of Democracy & Human Rights and Labour. (2020). *Vietnam 2020 Human Rights Report.*

Key words	Child labour prevalence garment industry
Source	Report
Description	The up-to-date findings are very important for future plans. This report finds that in the garment sector, children as young as age six reportedly produced garments in conditions of forced labour. The most recently available information from government raids, NGOs, and media reports during the year indicated this was most common in small, privately owned garment factories and informal workshops,

suggesting that future plans and policies should focus more on these types of factories and workshops as there can exist hidden child labour.

62. Vietnam Chamber of Commerce and Industry and Human Rights Commission. (2021, April 15). *Responsible business conduct and the apparel and footwear industry: Guidance for companies in Vietnam*.

Key words	Child labour prevalence in garment industry
Source	Report
Description	This paper demonstrates the situation of child labour in the garment industry, based on the results of the 2 nd National Survey in 2018. This Survey has pointed out that there are 44,597 child labourers in the textile and garment industry, accounting for 5% of all child labour in Vietnam. 19.8% of them are children under 15. Notably, about 42,801 children working in the garment manufacturing sector were involved in hazardous work. The 2nd National Survey in 2018 has also pointed out that there are 6,156 children working in the footwear sector who were involved in hazardous work.
Evaluation	What is noteworthy in this paper is that it demands for the transformation of soft law to hard law in order to enhance the binding obligations on stakeholders. It also clarifies the differences between “cause”, “contribute to” and “directly involve” in child labour issue.

63. Worker Rights Consortium. (2013, May). *Made in Vietnam: Labour rights violations in Vietnam’s export manufacturing sector*.

Key words	Garment industry, trafficking
Source	Report
Description	Report provides a detailed understanding of how children are pulled into the garment industry in Vietnam. There is a trafficking system from rural areas to major cities and the garment factory owners travel to rural districts to hunt for children. Worryingly, many garment factories lack a reliable system for age verification at work. In this context, children in rural and remote areas as well as those from ethnic minority groups should be given special attention.

Domestic work and small enterprises

64. International Labour Organisation. (2006). *Survey Report: Child Domestic Workers in Ho Chi Minh City*.

Key words	Causes of domestic child work, southern Vietnam region
Source	Report

Description	The findings of this survey calls for special attention to girls and the southern region of Vietnam. It also provides insights of child domestic workers and their household/parents, presenting an overall picture of factors leading to the rise of domestic workers. The push factors are (1) children wanting to earn money to improve family income or to share burden; (2) parents consent to send children to work for better facility and nutrition access and (3) children can lack interest in education. Pull factors are (1) the rapid economic developments leading to households being able to hire domestic workers, with children being cheaper and have a lack of knowledge on their rights and (2) more and more women are working and participating in social activities and therefore raising demands for helpers of house chores.
-------------	--

65. International Labour Organisation & General Statistics Office. (2016). *2016 Report on Informal Employment in Vietnam*.

Key words	Child labour, informal employment, informal enterprises
Source	Report
Description	The report presents two main findings on informal employment in Vietnam: (1) most of the non-agricultural informal employment is in production and manufacturing industries; construction; wholesale and retails, automobile and motorbike repairs and (2) out of the active labour force, the 15-24s age group has the highest share of informal employment: 60%, indicating that the number of premature workers in these sectors are large.

66. Kiss, L., Pocock, N. S., Naisanguansri, V., Suos, S., Dickson, B., Thuy, D., Koehler, J., Sirisup, K., Pongrungsee, N., Nguyen, V. A., Borland, R., Dhavan, P. & Zimmerman, C. (2015). Health of men, women, and children in post-trafficking services in Cambodia, Thailand, and Vietnam: An observational cross-sectional study. *The Lancet Global Health*, 3(3), 154-161.

Key words	Domestic child work, health study
Source	Academic journal article
Description	This is the first health study of a large and diverse sample of men, women, and child survivors of trafficking for various forms of exploitation (1015 in total). Violence and unsafe working conditions were common and psychological morbidity was associated with severity of abuse. Survivors of trafficking need access to health care, especially mental health care. The data of the study indicates that 2.9 percent of the total survivors were children exploited as workers or cleaners. In the case of domestic workers, they were repeatedly exposed to hazardous substances like dust, chemicals and pathogens.

67. Matsuno, A. & Blagbrough, J. (2006). *Child domestic labour in south-east and East Asia: Emerging good practices to combat it*. International Labour Office.

Key words	Domestic child work
-----------	---------------------

Source	Book
Description	This paper mentioned a problem that can be an obstacle in Vietnam's fight against child domestic workers: the consideration of child domestic workers as "helpers". This ambiguous term may lead to child labour being neglected and not handled adequately. More importantly, the paper provides very good practices from Vietnam's neighbouring countries: Cambodia, Indonesia and the Philippines.

68. McBride, M. (2018). Cleaning up the Industry: Improving Protections for Precarious and Child Domestic Workers. *Fordham International Law Journal*, 41(5)(10), 1335-1400.

Key words	Domestic child work
Source	Academic journal article
Description	In this paper, the author analyses that child domestic work is not always the 'worst form' of child labour. In domestic work, the 'worst forms' of child labour are situations in which the child is not able to leave the employment situation because of force or coercion, or is subject to abusive conditions that could harm their health and safety. In the worst cases, domestic work can amount to human trafficking. The author proposes that to eradicate these worst practices in child domestic labour, countries must adopt policies and frameworks that would inherently improve protections for adult domestic workers.

69. Pocock, N. S., Chan, C. W. & Zimmerman, C. (2021). Suitability of measurement tools for assessing the prevalence of child domestic work: A Rapid Systematic Review. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 18(5), 2357-2376.

Key words	Domestic child work definition, domestic child work prevalence
Source	Academic journal article
Description	The survey and estimation of child domestic prevalence have encountered various challenges, stemming from the absence of a globally established definition of child domestic workers and a globally agreed list of activities constituting child domestic work. By reviewing current methods, the authors concluded that these methods have undercounted, thereby failing to fully and accurately capture global prevalence of child domestic workers. They suggest using more detailed task-based methods, including carefully designed and tested approaches to detect child domestic workers. They also asked relevant stakeholders to revise their current approaches to include stronger question set modules in future surveys. According to them, improved prevalence estimation methods shall be a top priority in order to achieve greater policies and adequate attention concerning child domestic work.

70. Tran. H. (2021). The Impact Of Covid-19 On Child labour In Vietnam. *Science and Technology Development Journal*, 24(3), 2044-2048.

Key words	Child labour prevalence in informal enterprises
Source	Academic journal article
Description	This paper explains the problem of child labour in small enterprises, which is that some forms of child labour are easy to discern e.g. street children working for informal sectors in big cities or small enterprises with simple production technologies and relatively little capital. The situation becomes common because of children's beliefs about their suitability for certain jobs, and because more work can be extracted from them owing to their greater docility and lack of awareness regarding the ability to claim their rights. Another problem is that most children (before they reach the minimum working age) have to work in the informal sector without labour relations (such as exported seafood, farming, agriculture, domestic work, etc.) to support their family's economy. These two problems should be addressed in order to reduce and progress to eliminate child labour and to protect children in informal sector as well as small enterprises.

71. Webbink, E., Smits, J. & de Jong, E. (2012). Hidden child labour: Determinants of housework and family business work of children in 16 developing countries. *World Development*, 40(3), 631-642.

Key words	Hidden forms of child labour
Source	Academic journal article
Description	<p>This study provides an insight into the determinants of two "hidden" forms of child labour - housework and family business work - by analyzing representative data for 178.000 children living in 214 districts of 16 African and Asian developing countries. Most (70-80%) of the variation in both child labour forms is due to household level factors, with socio-economic variables (like parental education, possession of land/cattle) and demographic variables (birth order, number of siblings, missing parents, grandparents present) playing important roles. Supply of education (indicated by adult schooling level) and national level of development (for housework) are the most important context factors.</p> <p>The author also suggests three relevant factors that policy makers can stimulate changes: (1) the availability of electricity and tap water reduces the number of hours both girls and boys spend on housework; (2) Children spend fewer hours on both types of hidden child labour if the mother has at least primary education and (3) family size matters: the larger the family, the more children are engaged in hidden child labour.</p>